UNIVERSITY OF
TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 06110418 8

Contracts A

2009-2010

Casebook Vol 2

Professor Betty M. Ho

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

DEC - 2 2009

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Contracts A

2009-2010

Casebook Vol 2

Professor Betty M. Ho

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/contractslawgrou02hobe

Table of Contents

II. Vitiating elements

D. Public policy

1. General considerations
Egerton v. Brownlow..... 1
Richardson v. Mellish..... 1
Enderby Town Football Club Ltd. v. Football Association Ltd..... 1
Printing and Numerical Registering Co. v. Sampson..... 2

2. Public policy at common law
Re Baby M..... 2
Oldfield Transamerica Life Insurance Co. of Canada..... 6

3. Contravention of legislation

(a) The problem stated
Bank of Toronto v. Perkins..... 11
Kingshott v. Brunskill..... 11
Ashmore, Benson, Pease & Co. Ltd. v. A.V. Dawson Ltd..... 14
Alexander v. Rayson..... 16

(b) The rule

(c) Exceptions
St. John Shipping Corporation v. Joseph Rank Ltd..... 18
Holman v. Johnson..... 20
Amar Singh v. Kulubya..... 21
Kiriri Cotton Co. Ltd. v. Dewani..... 23
Ouston v. Zurowski..... 25
Transport North American Express Inc. v. New Solutions Financial Corp..... 27

(c) The new flexible approach
Still v. Canada (Minister of National Revenue – M.N.R.)..... 34

III. Contents of contract

A. Express terms

1. Proof of terms
The Law Commission, *Report on the Parole Evidence Rule*..... 37

2. Construction of terms
Towne v. Eisner..... 37
Prenn v. Simmonds..... 38
Federal Commerce and Navigation Co. Ltd. v. Tradax Export S.A..... 40

B. Implied terms

1. Terms implied in fact
Shirlaw v. Southern Foundries (1926) Ltd..... 42
The Moorcock..... 43
B.P. Refinery (Westernport) Pty. Ltd. v. Hastings Shire Council..... 43
Trollope & Colls Ltd. v. North West Metropolitan Regional Hospital Board.. 43
The Moorcock..... 44
Shirlaw v. Southern Foundries (1926), Ltd..... 45
Trollope & Colls Ltd. v. North West Metropolitan Regional Hospital Board... 49

2. Terms implied by custom

3. Terms implied by law
Lister v. Romford Ice and Cold Storage Ltd..... 53

IV. Performance and breach

A. Contingent conditions

Pym v. Campbell..... 57
Hargreaves Transport Ltd. v. Lynch..... 58
Turney v. Zhilka..... 60
Barnett v. Harrison..... 62

B. Order of performance

Kingston v. Preston..... 67

C. Relative importance of terms

Boone v. Eyre..... 69
Sale of Goods Act, s. 1 (1)..... 70
Hongkong Fir Shipping Co. Ltd. v. Kawasaki Kisen Kaisha Ltd..... 70

D. Breaches or failures to perform entitling innocent party to terminate

1. Express designation

2. Substantial failure
The Hansa Nord..... 73
Maple Flock Co. Ltd. v. Universal Furniture Products (Wembley) Ltd..... 74
Bettini v. Gye..... 77
Poussard v. Spiers..... 79
Reardon Smith Line Ltd. v. Yngvar Hansen-Tangen..... 81

E. Repudiation

Freeth v. Burr..... 85

F. Termination and effect of termination

Photo Production Ltd. v. Securicour Transport Ltd..... 86
McDonald v. Dennys Lascelles Ltd..... 86

F. Breach of entire obligations

Cutter v. Powell..... 87
Apportionment Act, s. 2..... 88
Sumpter v. Hedges..... 88
Hoenig v. Isaacs..... 89
Jacob & Youngs, Inc. v. Kent..... 91

V. Remedies

A. The principal doctrine

Wertheim v. Chicoutimi Pulp Co..... 93

B. Expectation damages

1. Objects

2. Types of loss

(a) Plaintiff's loss

(b) Direct expectation loss

(c) Consequential loss

(d) Non-pecuniary loss
Addis v. Gramophone Co. Ltd..... 94

Hobbs v. The London and South Western Railway Co..... 96
Herbert Clayton and Jack Waller Ltd. v. Oliver..... 97
Malik v. Bank of Credit and Commerce International S.A..... 98
Jarvis v. Swans Tours Ltd..... 103
Ruxley Electronics and Construction Ltd. v. Forsyth..... 105
Farley v. Skinner..... 105
Vorvis v. Insurance Corporation of British Columbia..... 107
Wallace v. United Grain Growers Ltd..... 110
Fidler v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada..... 116
Honda Canada Inc. v. Keays..... 120

C. Quantification of expectation damages

1. Difference in value
Hawkins v. McGee..... 124
Sale of Goods Act, s 48 (3)..... 126

2. Cost of performance
Groves v. John Wunder Co..... 127
Peevyhouse v. Garland Coal & Mining Co..... 138
Ruxley Electronics and Construction Ltd. v. Forsyth..... 138

3. Loss of profits
Charter v. Sullivan..... 142
Thompson (W.L.) Ltd. v. Robinson (Gunmakers) Ltd..... 144

4. Loss of a chance
Chaplin v. Hicks..... 146

D. Limitation of damages

1. Causation

2. Remoteness
Hadley v. Baxendale..... 148
Horne v. Midland Railway Company..... 152
Koufos v. C. Czarnikow Ltd..... 154
Victoria Lauandry (Windsor) Ltd. v. Newman Industries Ltd..... 159
Transfield Shipping Inc. v. Mercator Shipping Inc..... 161

3. Mitigation
British Westinghouse Electric and Manufacturing Co. Ltd. v. Underground Electric Railways Company of London Ltd..... 164
Hochster v. De La Tour..... 164

White and Carter (Councils) Ltd. v. McGregor..... 166
Finelli v. Dee..... 171

4. Date of assessment
Wroth v. Tyler..... 172
Johnson v. Agnew..... 176
Smelhago v. Paramdevan..... 180

E. Agreed damages

Dunlop Pneumatic Tyre Co. Ltd. v. New Garage and Motor Co. Ltd..... 184
Philips Hong Kong Ltd. v. The Attorney General of Hong Kong..... 187
J.G. Collins Insurance Agencies Ltd. v. Elsley Estate..... 190
Howe v. Smith..... 193
Workers Trust and Merchant Bank Ltd. v. Dojap Investments Ltd..... 193

F. Specific relief

1. Action for an agreed sum

2. Specific performance and injunctions
Falcke v. Gray..... 198
Sky Petroleum Ltd. v. V.I.P. Petroleum Ltd..... 201
Smelhago v. Paramadevan..... 202
Co-operative Insurance Society Ltd. v. Argyll Stores (Holdings) Ltd..... 204
Warner Brothers Pictures, Inc. v. Nelson..... 208
Warren v. Mendy..... 211

G Alternative remedy: reliance damages
Anglia Television Ltd. v. Reed..... 214

H. Alternative remedy: disgorgement of profits of defendants

Attorney General v. Blake..... 216

I. Punitive damages

Whiten v. Pilot Insurance Co..... 221
Fidler v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada..... 230

VI. Discharge by agreement

Raggow v. Scougall and Co..... 231
Gilbert Steel Ltd. v. University Construction Ltd..... 232

Foakes v. Beer..... 234
Re Selectmove Ltd..... 238
Callisher v. Bischoffsheim..... 239

VII. Discharge by frustration

Paradine v. Jane..... 239
Taylor v. Caldwell..... 241
Amalgamated Investment & Property Co. Ltd. v. John Walker & Sons Ltd.... 243
Fibrosa Spolka Akcyjna v. Fairbairn Lawson Combe Barbour Ltd..... 244

VIII. Exemption clauses

A. Incorporation of exemption clauses into the contract

B. Construction of exemption of clauses

George Mitchell (Chesterhall) Ltd. v. Finney Lock Seeds Ltd..... 247
Canada Steamship Lines Ltd. v. The King..... 247

C. Disapplying exemption clauses

Harrow Karsales Ltd. v. Wallis..... 248
Suisse Atlantique Societe D'Armement Maritime S.A..... 249
Photo Production Ltd. v. Securicor Transport Ltd..... 253
George Mitchell (Chesterhall) Ltd. v. Finney Lock Seeds Ltd..... 259
Hunter Engineering Co. v. Syncrude Canada Ltd..... 261

IX. Unjust enrichment

A. General principles

Kelly v. Solari..... 271
Fibrosa v. Fairbairn, Lawson & Co..... 272
Westdeutsche Landesbank Girozentrale v. Islington London Borough Council. 272
Moses v. Macerlan..... 272

B. Unjust enrichment in contractual context - general

Hunt v. Silk..... 273
Westdeutsche Landesbank Girozentrale v. Islington London Borough Council..274
Goss v. Chilcott.....

C. Incomplete bargaining

British Steel Corporation v. Cleveland Bridge Co. Ltd..... 274

D. Termination by breach

Dies v. British and International Mining and Finance Corporation, Ltd.... 274
De Bernardy v. Harding..... 277

E. Contracts against public policy

Bush v. Canfield..... 277
Boone v. Coe..... 280
Deglman v. The Guaranty Trust Company of Canada..... 281
Westdeutsche Landesbank Girozentrale v. Islington London Borough Council..282
Goss v. Chilcott..... 283

X. Estoppel

16 Halsbury's Laws of England..... 285
George Whitechurch Ltd. v. Cavanagh..... 285
Mardorf Peach & Co. Ltd. v. Attica Sea Carriers Corporation of Liberia... 285
Ramsden v. Dyson..... 286
Hughes v. Metropolitan Railway Co..... 286
Central London Property Trust Ltd. v. High Trees House Ltd..... 288
Combe v. Combe..... 290
Ajayi v. R.T. Briscoe (Nigeria) Ltd..... 293
Woodhouse A.C. Israel Cocoa Ltd. S.A. v. Nigerian Produce Marketing Co... 293
Walton Stores (Interstate) Ltd. v. Maher..... 294
Restatement, s. 90..... 305
Hoffman v. Red Owl Stores, Inc..... 305

XI. Third party beneficiaries

Tweddle v. Atkinson..... 311
Dunlop Pneumatic Tyre Co. Ltd. v. Selfridge and Co. Ltd..... 312
Beswick v. Beswick..... 314
Jackson v. Horizon Holidays Ltd..... 317
New Zealand Shipping Co. Ltd. v. A.M. Satterthwaite & Co. Ltd..... 319
London Drugs Ltd. v. Kuehne & Nagel International Ltd..... 323
Fraser River Pile & Dredge Ltd. v. Can-Dive Services Ltd..... 328